

*Joanna Marszałek-Kawa*

Nicolaus Copernicus University in Toruń, Poland

e-mail: [Joanna.Marszalek-Kawa@umk.pl](mailto:Joanna.Marszalek-Kawa@umk.pl),

ORCID ID: 0000-0002-4201-8028

*Beata Tomaszewska-Hołub*

University of Warmia and Mazury in Olsztyn, Poland

e-mail: [beata.holub@uwm.edu.pl](mailto:beata.holub@uwm.edu.pl)

ORCID ID: 0000-0002-5829-5986

*Adam Hołub*

Nicolaus Copernicus University in Toruń, Poland

e-mail: [adam.holub@umk.pl](mailto:adam.holub@umk.pl),

ORCID ID:0000-0002-8865-6543

**SELECTED INSTITUTIONAL AND LEGAL  
ARRANGEMENTS REGARDING THE PROTECTION OF  
STATES AGAINST RADICALISM AND EXTREMISM.  
THE CASE OF FRANCE, GERMANY AND THE  
RUSSIAN FEDERATION**

**Abstract**

The countries that have experienced the phenomenon of terrorism have established appropriate institutional and legal systems to counteract this threat. France, Germany and the Russian Federation all have a history of terrorist attacks on their territory. Each of these countries has proper legal and institutional arrangements. Democratic states use these tools to protect democratic values, while the Russian Federation also uses them to

suppress political opposition and as a part of a larger system of armed struggle against Ukraine. Regardless of the political regime, each country has a 'self-defence' structure which ensures the stability of the system.

### KEYWORDS

radicalism, extremism, legal system, political system, combatting radicalism, combatting extremism

### SŁOWA KLUCZOWE

radykalizm, ekstremizm, system prawny, system polityczny, zwalczanie radykalizmu, zwalczanie ekstremizmu

### INTRODUCTION

The spectre of threats to contemporary political and, consequently, legal systems encompasses both the extreme left and right. It should be pointed out that changes in legal and political systems are proposed also by the representatives of religious radicalism. This issue particularly concerns France and Germany, where – both in the 20<sup>th</sup> and 21<sup>st</sup> centuries – extreme organizations and movements that negated liberal and democratic values emerged. Both countries saw the extensive activity of the extreme left associated with the period of contesting the system of the 1960s. They were not free from the extreme right-wing movements, either. Moreover, both these countries were affected by a threat from Islamic radicalism, which became a serious issue in the 21<sup>st</sup> century. What was also worrying was the activity of the extreme right which contested the constitutional and legal order of Germany. A particular example was the movement called Reich Citizens (Reichsbürger), wiped out by specially appointed institutions of the state.<sup>1</sup> It should be indicated that threats to modern democracy are generated by, among other things, contemporary processes of an economic, social and political nature. The 21<sup>st</sup> century witnessed a very serious refugee crisis,<sup>2</sup> one of the consequences

---

<sup>1</sup> Bundesamt für Verfassungsschutz, "Reichsbürger" and "Selbstverwalter" – Enemies of the State, *Profiteers, Conspiracy Theorists*, Cologne 2018; L. Gibadło, M. Kędziński, *Niemcy: aresztowania pod zarzutem przygotowań do puczu*, <https://www.osw.waw.pl/pl/publikacje/analizy/2022-12-07/niemcy-aresztowania-pod-zarzutem-przygotowan-do-puczu> (accessed 20 February 2023).

<sup>2</sup> J. Marszałek-Kawa, D. Plecka, A. Hołub, *Social Security. Selected Aspects*, Toruń 2018.

of which was a rise in extreme right sentiments among the inhabitants of Europe and the establishment or electoral growth of anti-immigrant parties and organizations. What had a significant impact on the social mood was the COVID-19 pandemic, which brought about a widespread wave of protests against the related state restrictions. Another factor was a strong anti-globalist movement at the turn of the 20<sup>th</sup> and 21<sup>st</sup> centuries, which was of a radical character, too. Russia has also experienced the phenomenon of terrorism, also after the fall of the USSR. However, the tools and measures that the Russian authorities have adopted to counteract terrorist threats are also used for implementing the current state policy, i.e., for combatting political opposition. Thus, it is safe to say that the same institutional and legal arrangements in democratic and authoritarian states may serve different purposes. To study this research problem, we compared some anti-terrorist measures in the examined countries. It was therefore necessary to analyse the institutional arrangements and activities in all three states. In the face of the growing internal threats, democratic states have developed appropriate institutional and legal solutions to protect their political and, consequently, legal system.

### THE FEDERAL REPUBLIC OF GERMANY – ‘PACKAGE’ SOLUTIONS

The German state’s activities stem from the experience of a democratic state that the Weimar Republic was supposed to be. Its system did not prevent the totalitarian movement from taking power, so the post-war authorities deemed it necessary to implement measures protecting freedom, at the same time reducing a threat from its opponents. This attitude is reflected in the expression *Streitbare Demokratie* (militant democracy), which involves the institutional and legal concept of the neutralization of threats to the democratic system.<sup>3</sup>

In connection with the activity of the right-wing and religious extremists, the Joint Centre for Countering Extremism and Terrorism (Gemeinsamen Extremismus- und Terrorismusabwehrzentrums zur Bekämpfung des Rechtsextremismus/-terrorismus, des Linksextremismus/-terrorismus, des Ausländerextremismus/-terrorismus und der Spionage/Proliferation, GETZ) was established in Cologne in 2012.<sup>4</sup> The Centre is a platform for exchanging current and expert

---

<sup>3</sup> H.-J. Papier, W. Durner, *Streitbare Demokratie*, “Archiv Des Öffentlichen Rechts” 2003, Bd.128, H. 3, pp. 340–371, <http://www.jstor.org/stable/44316813> (accessed 20 February 2023).

<sup>4</sup> Presseinformation des Bundesamtes für Verfassungsschutz (BfV) zum Start des Gemeinsamen Extremismus- und Terrorismusabwehrzentrums zur Bekämpfung des Rechtsextremismus/-terrorismus, des Linksextremismus/-terrorismus, des Ausländerextremismus/-terrorismus und der Spionage/Proliferation (GETZ), abgerufen am 17. November 2012; *Eröffnung des Gemeinsamen*

information for the police and intelligence services at the federal and state level in order to combat extremism and terrorism, as well as the right-wing, left-wing and foreign counterintelligence, including aspects related to proliferation. It should be pointed out that the Centre was modelled after the Joint Centre for Countering Terrorism (Gemeinsame Terrorismusabwehrzentrum, GTAZ), which was established in 2004 in Berlin to combat Islamic terrorism.

The predecessor of the GETZ is the Joint Centre for Defending Against the Right-Wing Extremism/Terrorism (Gemeinsame Abwehrzentrum gegen Rechtsextremismus/-terrorismus, GAR). It consists of the Information and Analysis Unit of the Police and Intelligence (Polizeilichen und der Nachrichtendienstlichen Informations- und Analysestelle, PIAS and Nachrichtendienstliche Informations- und Analysestelle, NIAS). Although the equality of partners and the exclusively information-and-communication character of this entity are stressed, the Federal Office for the Protection of the Constitution Protection (Bundesamt für Verfassungsschutz, BfV, UOK) and the Bundeskriminalamt, BKA, are in charge of the general management. On account of its organizational structure, however, there is no leading entity and the representatives of all participating institutions cooperate on equal terms. The following entities take part in the Centre's activities: the Federal Office for the Protection of the Constitution (Bundesamt für Verfassungsschutz, BfV), the Federal Intelligence Service (Bundesnachrichtendienst, BND), the Federal Bureau of the Military Counterintelligence (Bundesamt für den Militärischen Abschirmdienst, BAMAD), 16 state offices for the protection of the constitution (Landesämter für Verfassungsschutz, LfV), the Federal Criminal Police Office (Bundeskriminalamt, BKA), the Federal Police (Bundespolizei, BPOL), the European Police Office (Europäisches Polizeiamt, Europol), the Prosecutor General (Generalbundesanwalt, GBA), the General Customs Directorate (Generalzolldirektion, GZD), 16 state offices for criminal investigations (Landeskriminalämter, LKÄ), the Federal Office for Migration and Refugees (Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge, BAMF), and the Federal Office for Economy and Export Control (Bundesamt für Wirtschaft und Ausfuhrkontrolle, BAFA).<sup>5</sup>

Within the BKA, a special division for state protection issues was established (Polizeilicher Staatsschutz, ST). In 2019, two more departments were set up in the BKA, one responsible for countering threats from political extremism (Abteilung "Polizeilicher Staatsschutz", ST) and the other dealing with Islamic radicals

---

*men Extremismus- und Terrorismusabwehrzentrums (GETZ)*, [https://www.bmi.bund.de/Shared-Docs/pressemitteilungen/DE/2012/11/eroeffnung\\_getz.html](https://www.bmi.bund.de/Shared-Docs/pressemitteilungen/DE/2012/11/eroeffnung_getz.html) (accessed 20 January 2023).

<sup>5</sup> *Gemeinsames Extremismus- und Terrorismusabwehrzentrum (GETZ)*, [https://www.verfassungsschutz.de/DE/verfassungsschutz/auftrag/zusammenarbeit-im-in-und-ausland/getz/getz\\_node.html](https://www.verfassungsschutz.de/DE/verfassungsschutz/auftrag/zusammenarbeit-im-in-und-ausland/getz/getz_node.html) (accessed 20 January 2023).

(Abteilung TE, Islamistisch motivierter Terrorismus/Extremismus).<sup>6</sup> The ST department focuses mainly on politically motivated offences “against the life, health or freedom of members of federal constitutional bodies and their guests. Moreover, the department investigates cases of espionage, proliferation, illegal trade in technology and commodities, state terrorism, intelligence and cyber-crime controlled by the state”.<sup>7</sup>

In response to the 11 September 2001 attacks in the USA, the German authorities proposed new statutory regulations on combatting terrorism.<sup>8</sup> They saw the relation between extremism and terrorism, so in the first ‘security package’ the government dealt with the problem of religious and philosophical organizations which appealed to extremism in their programmes. The package made it possible to impose a ban on the activity of organizations which had exercised the principle of religious freedom before.<sup>9</sup> What was interesting was the fact that the solution was proposed by the minister of internal affairs in Gerhard Schröder’s government, Otto Schilli, just a week before the attack on the World Trade Centre in 2001. He emphasized that the new arrangements were targeted mainly at Islamic groups.<sup>10</sup> Consequently, a number of Muslim organizations in Germany were delegalized.<sup>11</sup>

The problem of international terrorism made Germany address the issue of penalties for belonging to and supporting terrorist organizations of an international character, which was regulated in paragraph 129b of the Penal Code: “Provisions of paragraph 129 and 129a also apply to organized crime groups abroad”.<sup>12</sup>

On 14 December 2001, the Bundestag adopted the second ‘security package’, introducing 17 amendments to acts and five changes in implementing acts. The amendments concerned the *Act on the Federal Office for the Protection of the*

<sup>6</sup> BKA verstärkt den Kampf gegen den islamistischen Terrorismus Neue Abteilung „TE“ im Bundeskriminalamt hat heute die Arbeit aufgenommen, [https://www.bka.de/DE/Presse/Listenseite\\_Pressemitteilungen/2019/Presse2019/191101\\_AbteilungTE.html;jsessionid=9B6239155404A43DA7680068F5CAFDB9.live0611?nn=50040](https://www.bka.de/DE/Presse/Listenseite_Pressemitteilungen/2019/Presse2019/191101_AbteilungTE.html;jsessionid=9B6239155404A43DA7680068F5CAFDB9.live0611?nn=50040) (accessed 20 January 2023).

<sup>7</sup> Abteilung “Polizeilicher Staatsschutz“ (ST), [https://www.bka.de/DE/DasBKA/OrganisationAufbau/Fachabteilungen/PolizeilicherStaatsschutz/polizeilicherstaatsschutz\\_node.html](https://www.bka.de/DE/DasBKA/OrganisationAufbau/Fachabteilungen/PolizeilicherStaatsschutz/polizeilicherstaatsschutz_node.html) (accessed 20 January 2023).

<sup>8</sup> A. Hołub, *Niemieckie „pakiety antyterrorystyczne” – odpowiedź na zagrożenie terroryzmem XXI wieku*, (in:) W. Zubrzycki, K. Jałoszyński, (eds.), *Polska ustawa antyterrorystyczna – odpowiedź na zagrożenia współczesnym terroryzmem*, Szczytno 2016, pp. 139–152.

<sup>9</sup> I. Oleksiewicz, *Polityka antyterrorystyczna Unii Europejskiej*, Lublin 2013, p. 424; H.M. Heinig, *Die Verfassung der Religion: Beiträge zum Religionsverfassungsrecht*, Tübingen 2014, p. 40.

<sup>10</sup> *Sicherheitspaket 1*, “Die Welt”, 19 October 2001, <http://www.welt.de/print-welt/article482247/Sicherheitspaket-1.html> (accessed 20 January 2023).

<sup>11</sup> Der Verfassungsschutz, <https://www.verfassungsschutz.de/de/arbeitsfelder/af-islamismus-und-islamistischer-terrorismus/verbotene-organisationen-islamismus> (accessed 20 January 2023).

<sup>12</sup> Bundesministerium der Justiz und für Verbraucherschutz *Strafgesetzbuch (StGB)*, para. 129b, [https://www.gesetze-im-internet.de/stgb/inhalts\\_bersicht.html](https://www.gesetze-im-internet.de/stgb/inhalts_bersicht.html) (accessed 20 January 2023).

*Constitution* (Bundesverfassungsschutzgesetz), the *Act of the Military Counterintelligence Service* MAD (Gesetz über den militärischen Abschirmdienst), the *Act on the Federal Intelligence Service* BND (Gesetz über den Bundesnachrichtendienst), the *Act on the Restriction of the Secrecy of Mail, Post and Telecommunications* (Gesetz zur Beschränkung des Brief-, Post- und Fernmeldegeheimnisses), the *Security Clearance Check Act* (Sicherheitsüberprüfungsgesetz), the *Act on the Protection of Borders* (Bundesgrenzschutzgesetz), the *Passport Act* (Passgesetz), the *Act on Identity Cards* (Gesetz über Personalausweise), the *Act on Associations* (Vereinsgesetz), the *Act on the Federal Criminal Police Office* (Bundeskriminalamtgesetz), the *Act on Foreigners* (Ausländergesetz), the *Asylum Act* (Asylverfahrensgesetz), the *Act on the Central Register of Foreigners* (Gesetz über das Ausländerzentralregister), the *Act on Air Transportation* (Luftverkehrsgesetz), the *Act on Energy* (Energiesicherungsgesetz) and the regulations concerning the creation of databases of foreigners.

The main problem addressed in these acts was the issue of obtaining, by internal security entities, data facilitating the identification of people or organizations that pose a terrorist threat to Germany. Another reason behind the changes was the intention to improve cooperation between the different elements of the German anti-terrorist system.<sup>13</sup>

Among the authorities indicated above, it was the Federal Criminal Police Office that was recognized as the leading entity in criminal procedures. It was deemed necessary to extend its powers regarding the collection of data in the context of countering terrorism.<sup>14</sup> The significance of the BKA in combatting terrorism was highlighted in the act of 31 December 2008, which specified the role and tasks of this institution.<sup>15</sup> The office was given the leading role in the case of threats of the national character (at least two states were at risk) if a threat was beyond the scope of the state police or if state authorities asked it for intervention. The act granted a number of powers as regards gathering information concerning people who could be a potential threat to the security of Germany from the perspective of international terrorism.

In June 2016, the government – acting with an aim to improve cooperation in combatting terrorism – proposed a new draft *Act on taking measures to counter terrorism*.<sup>16</sup> It was emphasized that there was a need for intelligence cooperation

---

<sup>13</sup> *Sicherheitspaket II, Mehr Kompetenzen*, <http://www.n-tv.de/politik/Mehr-Kompetenzen-article102602.html> (accessed 20 January 2023).

<sup>14</sup> *Entwurf eines Gesetzes zur Bekämpfung des internationalen Terrorismus (Terrorismusbekämpfungsgesetz), Gesetzentwurf der Fraktionen SPD und BÜNDNIS 90/DIE GRÜNEN*, Deutscher Bundestag 14. Wahlperiode, Drucksache 14/7386 (neu), 8 November 2001.

<sup>15</sup> *Gesetz zur Abwehr von Gefahren des internationalen Terrorismus durch das Bundeskriminalamt* BGBl. I, 2008, p. 3083.

<sup>16</sup> *Entwurf eines Gesetzes zum besseren Informationsaustausch bei der Bekämpfung des internationalen Terrorismus. Gesetzentwurf der Fraktionen der CDU/CSU und SPD*, Deutscher Bundestag 18. Wahlperiode, Drucksache 18/8702, 7 June 2016.

between services from different countries, following the example of the Counter Terrorism Group (CTG), which includes members from the European Union states and Norway and Switzerland. It was pointed out that the German services, which had information about Islam-related terrorism, could not exchange data with foreign partners due to the lack of legal basis. The proposed act was to fill in this gap in the law. The bill initiators believed that information exchange with foreign services would make it easier for the German services (UOK) to identify people referred to as ‘Foreign Terrorist Fighters’, who returned from threatened regions and joined Salafists in Germany. Thus, they also proposed appropriate amendments to the *Act on the UOK* and the *Act on the BND*. In order to improve the preventive and reconnaissance activity of the Federal Police, it was stressed that it had the same powers as the police of individual states. The use of operational techniques was given special emphasis.

The measures to counter terrorism proposed by the German government were not free of criticism from the proponents of broadly defined civil liberties who believed that it was unacceptable to restrict people’s right to privacy in the liberal-democratic state, even in the name of ensuring security.

The statutory ‘security packages’ constituted not only a set of legal norms necessary to combat terrorism, but also the procedural and institutional foundations by granting indispensable instruments to institutions that counter terrorism. It should be pointed out that the changes mainly concerned obtaining, analysing and exchanging information. This, in turn, requires efficient cooperation among all entities dealing with security and terrorist threats, both at the state and federal levels. Another problem, also related to the global situation – mass migration and members of terrorist organizations flowing into the German territory – is the identification of people.

## FRANCE AND THE THREAT OF EXTREMISM

The attacks of Islamic extremists carried out in 2015 were not a new or unknown experience to France. The state contended with radicalism and extremism as early as before World War Two. It was already then that it had to adapt its organizational and legislative measures to the dynamics of changes in the sphere of internal threats.

What helped to fight political radicalism threatening the stability of the French political system was the *Act on combat groups and private militia*.<sup>17</sup> It secured a convenient and effective tool for tackling threats from radical groups.

---

<sup>17</sup> *Loi du 10 janvier 1936 sur les groupes de combat et milices privées*, “Journal officiel de la République Française”, 12 January 1936, p. 522.

Under the provisions of the act, the state could dissolve the organizations which: 1) instigated armed street protests; 2) or which (except for government approved associations that train its members for military service in connection with physical education or sports) would have the character of a combat group or private militia; 3) or which would aim to violate the territorial integrity of the state or attack the republican form of government by force”.<sup>18</sup> In 1944, the fourth point was added: “or the activity of which would tend to hinder the activities aimed at resuming republican legitimacy”.<sup>19</sup> In 1951, the fifth criterion was formulated: “or which would aim to gather people convicted of cooperation with the enemy or to elevate such cooperation”.<sup>20</sup> In 1972, the sixth point was added: “or which would cause discrimination, hate or violence towards a person or a group of people on account of their background, belonging or lack of belonging to an ethnic group, nation, race or religion, or which would promote the ideas or theories that justify or encourage such discrimination, hate or violence”.<sup>21</sup> In 1986, the act on countering terrorism was extended by another criterion: “or which would engage, on or from the territory of France, in the activity aimed at provoking terrorist acts in France or abroad”.<sup>22</sup> The Code of internal security (Code de la sécurité intérieure) of 2012, in Article 212-1, adopted all the criteria of armed organizations the activity of which is forbidden under French law.<sup>23</sup> In 2023, the Code of Internal Security specified that the organizations subject to disbandment include those which: “provoke demonstrations or acts of violence towards people or property, have a character of combat groups or private militia; the aim of which is to breach the territorial integrity or overthrow the republican form of government; which provoke or contribute to discrimination, hate or violence towards a person or a group of people on account of their origin, gender, sexual orientation, gender identity or real or alleged belonging, or the lack of belonging to an ethnic group, nation, race

<sup>18</sup> *Ibidem*.

<sup>19</sup> *Ordonnance du 30 décembre 1944 portant modification de la loi du 10 janvier 1936 sur les groupes de combat et milices privées*, “Journal officiel de la République Française”, No. 163 du 31 décembre 1944, pp. 2145–2146.

<sup>20</sup> *Article 29 de la loi n° 51-18 du 5 janvier 1951 portant amnistie, instituant un régime de libération anticipée, limitant les effets de la dégradation nationale et réprimant les activités antinationales*, “Journal officiel de la République Française”, 6 Janvier 1951, <https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexteArticle.do?idArticle=LEGIARTI000006272593&cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006068088&categorieLien=id> (accessed 20 January 2023).

<sup>21</sup> *Article 9 de la loi n° 72-546 du 1<sup>er</sup> juillet 1972 relative à la lutte contre le racisme*, “Journal officiel de la République Française” No. 0154, 2 July 1972, p. 6803.

<sup>22</sup> *Article 7 de la loi n° 86-1020 du 9 septembre 1986 relative à la lutte contre le terrorisme et aux atteintes à la sûreté de l’État*, “Journal officiel de la République Française”, 10 September 1986, No. 210, pp. 10956–10958.

<sup>23</sup> *Article L212-1, Code de la sécurité intérieure. Version consolidée au 24 octobre 2019*, [https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichCode.do?jsessionid=13792A42D9E4673B2FBFDD0E7E902C10.tplgfr28s\\_2?idSectionTA=LEGISCTA000025508340&cidTexte=LEGITEXT000025503132&dateTexte=20191027](https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichCode.do?jsessionid=13792A42D9E4673B2FBFDD0E7E902C10.tplgfr28s_2?idSectionTA=LEGISCTA000025508340&cidTexte=LEGITEXT000025503132&dateTexte=20191027) (accessed 20 January 2023).

or religion, or promoting the ideas or theories that justify or encourage such discrimination, hate or violence or which engage, on or from the territory of France, in the activity aimed at provoking terrorist acts in France or abroad”.<sup>24</sup>

The obligation to respect the principles of the democratic state has been specified by Article 4 of the Constitution of the 5<sup>th</sup> Republic.<sup>25</sup> Crimes against the state have been addressed in more detail in the Penal Code.<sup>26</sup> The main interests of the state subject to protection included, apart from the political system (the republican form of government): independence, territorial integrity, security, the means of defence and diplomacy, the protection of population in France and abroad, environmental sustainability and the key elements of the scientific and economic potential and cultural heritage.<sup>27</sup> The Penal Code<sup>28</sup> does not define terrorism, but a terrorist act, which involves a deliberate individual or collective attempt aimed at a serious disturbance of public order through intimidation.<sup>29</sup> Such acts include, in particular: “1) Intentional endangerment or damage to the integrity of a person, kidnapping and confinement, the seizure of an airplane, a boat or any other means of transport, (...), 2) Theft, extortion, destruction, damage, and cybercrime specified in Book III of the Penal Code, 3) Offences committed by combat groups or disbanded (delegalized) movements, 4) Offences connected with explosive substances or nuclear weapons, 5) Hiding income from the abovementioned offences, 6) Money laundering offences, 7) The use of inside information with an intention to disturb the proper functioning of the regulated market or the multilateral exchange platform by misleading other people”.<sup>30</sup> Moreover, terrorist acts include the activities the aim of which is a serious disturbance of public order by intimi-

<sup>24</sup> *Code de la sécurité intérieure*, [https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/codes/section\\_lc/LEGITEXT000025503132/LEGISCTA\\_000025505187/#\\_LEGISCTA000025508342](https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/codes/section_lc/LEGITEXT000025503132/LEGISCTA_000025505187/#_LEGISCTA000025508342) (accessed 20 January 2023).

<sup>25</sup> Article 4. Political parties and groups compete with each other by way of elections. They are established and act freely. They should abide by the principles of national sovereignty and democracy. *Konstytucja Republiki Francuskiej z dnia 4 października 1958 r.*, translated by W. Skrzydło, as of 23 July 2008, <http://libr.sejm.gov.pl/tek01/txt/konst/francja2011.html> (accessed 20 January 2023).

<sup>26</sup> *Livre IV : Des crimes et délits contre la nation, l'Etat et la paix publique, Code Penal, Code pénal, Version consolidée au 20 septembre 2019*, <https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichCode.do?cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006070719&dateTexte=20191020> (accessed 20 January 2023).

<sup>27</sup> *Ibidem*, Article 410-1.

<sup>28</sup> Changes in the Penal Code and the Code of Criminal Procedure concerning the issue of terrorist acts were introduced under act No. 86-1020 of 9 September 1986 on countering terrorism and attacks on the security of the state (*Loi n° 86-1020 du 9 septembre 1986 relative à la lutte contre le terrorisme*, “Journal officiel de la République Française”, 10 September 1986, No. 210, pp. 10956–10958).

<sup>29</sup> *Code pénal, Version consolidée au 20 septembre 2019*..., Article 421-1.

<sup>30</sup> *Code monétaire et financier*, Dernière modification: 25 octobre 2019, art. L. 465-1 do L. 465-3, [https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichCode.do;jsessionid=0F204B989BEB83B344A-350D5E4A72\\_B83.tplgfr28s\\_2?cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006072026&dateTexte=20130728](https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichCode.do;jsessionid=0F204B989BEB83B344A-350D5E4A72_B83.tplgfr28s_2?cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006072026&dateTexte=20130728) (accessed 20 January 2023).

dition or terror, consisting in the introduction into the atmosphere, in the ground, in the soil, in food or its ingredients, or in waters, including the territorial waters of the sea, of any substance which may endanger the health of people or animals or the natural environment.<sup>31</sup> Terrorist acts also consist in financing terrorist undertakings by providing, collecting and managing securities or property with an intent to use them or being aware that they will be used, in whole or in part, for the commission of any terrorist act.<sup>32</sup> Encouraging to commit terrorist acts and praising them publicly have also been recognized as punishable offences.<sup>33</sup>

Participation in an unlawful assembly, rally, crowd, mass demonstration, as well as in armed groups and delegalized (disbanded) organizations was recognized as a violation of public order. It was specified that an “unlawful assembly is any gathering of persons on the public highway or in any place open to the public where it is liable to breach the public peace”.<sup>34</sup> The participant of the assembly that was called to disperse, who deliberately conceals the whole or part of their face in order not to be identified, is subject to a high fine.<sup>35</sup> In the case of an armed assembly, “directly inciting (...), either through shouting or public speeches, or through writings, whether displayed or distributed, or through writings, words or pictures broadcast in any way, is punished by one year’s imprisonment or a fine of €15,0000”.<sup>36</sup>

After World War Two, it was the services of internal intelligence that dealt with identifying and combatting threats to the state and its system. They included: the Directorate of Territorial Surveillance (Direction de la Surveillance du Territoire, DST)<sup>37</sup> and the Central Directorate of Criminal Intelligence (Direction Centrale des Renseignements Généraux, DCRG). It should also be mentioned that France had to secure its territories outside its borders. The role of the external intelligence was therefore significant. The DST was responsible for detecting threats from radical groups, espionage of foreign states, terrorism, and protecting the interests (including the economic ones) of France.

In the last quarter of the 20<sup>th</sup> century, terrorist threats to the stability of the system intensified, so the need arose to establish a cohesive security system for countering terrorism irrespective of its origin. The system consists of (also in the second decade of the 21<sup>st</sup> century) entities such as: the President of the Republic, the Prime Minister, the Ministry of Internal Affairs, the Ministry of Defence, and the Ministry of Economy, Finance and Industry. The head of state’s task is to set

<sup>31</sup> *Code pénal, Version consolidée au 20 septembre 2019...*, Art. 421-2.

<sup>32</sup> *Ibidem*, Art. 421-2-2-2.

<sup>33</sup> *Ibidem*, Art. 421-2-5.

<sup>34</sup> *Ibidem*, Art. 431-3.

<sup>35</sup> *Ibidem*, Art. 431-4.

<sup>36</sup> *Ibidem*, Art. 431-6.

<sup>37</sup> The DST was established upon the initiative of Charles de Gaulle in 1944. *Décret n° 82-1100 du 22 décembre 1982 fixant les attributions de la direction de la surveillance du territoire*, <http://admi.net/jo/dec82-1100.html> (accessed 20 January 2023).

basic guidelines and priorities of the national security policy, including the principal directions of countering terrorism. The Prime Minister's role is mainly to implement the President's initiatives by delegating tasks to competent ministries. The Ministry of Internal Affairs is in charge of securing the stability of the state. It has specialized units to deal with the issue of terrorism and, thus, extremism: the Central Directorate of Internal Intelligence (Direction Centrale du Renseignement Intérieur, DCRI)<sup>38</sup> and the General Directorate of the National Police (Direction Générale de la Police Nationale, DGPN). As part of the General Directorate of the National Police, responsible for order and safety on the territory of the state, the Directorate for Anti-terrorism (La Sous-direction Anti-Terroriste, SDAT) was set up.

In 1984, the Coordinating Unit for Countering Terrorism (L'Unité de Coordination de la Lutte Antiterroriste, UCLAT) was established.<sup>39</sup> It is responsible for coordinating the activities of all the departments involved in combatting terrorism. In emergency situations, the UCLAT recommends that the terrorism threat level for France should be raised, changing the degree within the framework of the Plan of Preventing and Responding to Terrorist Threats (Vigilance et protection des installations contre les risques d'attentats terroristes à l'explosif, VIGIP-IRATE) created in 1978. What is a relatively new solution is the establishment of the National Anti-Terrorism Prosecutor's Office (Parquet national antiterroriste, PNAT) on 1 July 2019. Its responsibilities include, among other things, the prosecution of terrorist crimes and offences related to the proliferation and means of carrying nuclear weapons, crimes against humanity, war crimes and offences, and the crimes committed by state authorities.<sup>40</sup>

In the field of prevention of radicalization and extremism, the General Secretariat of the

Inter-ministerial Committee for the Prevention of Delinquency and Radicalization (Le Secrétariat général du Comité interministériel de prévention de la délinquance et de la radicalisation, SG-CIPDR) was established.<sup>41</sup> It is headed by

---

<sup>38</sup> In 2008, in order to avoid unnecessary competence disputes and cut-throat competition, the DST and the DCRG were merged into the Central Directorate of Internal Intelligence. In 2014, the institution was transformed into the General Directorate of Internal Security (Direction Générale de la Sécurité Intérieure, DGSI).

<sup>39</sup> In 2014, the anti-terrorism system was modernized and the UCLAT became the pillar of combatting radicalization and the jihadist network in France.

<sup>40</sup> Zoom sur le nouveau Parquet national antiterroriste, <http://www.justice.gouv.fr/justice-penale-11330/zoom-sur-le-nouveau-parquet-national-antiterroriste-32661.html> (accessed 20 March 2023); A. Olech, *Unikalne rozwiązania Republiki Francuskiej w walce z terroryzmem i radykalizacją*, "Terroryzm – Studia, Analizy, Prewencja" 2022, No. 1 (1), pp. 123–166.

<sup>41</sup> *Code de la sécurité intérieure, Version en vigueur au 23 novembre 2021. Section 1: Comité interministériel de prévention de la délinquance et de la radicalisation*, art. D132-1 à D132-4, [https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/codes/section\\_lc/LEGITEXT000025503132/LEGISCTA000028284837/#LEGISCTA000028287504](https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/codes/section_lc/LEGITEXT000025503132/LEGISCTA000028284837/#LEGISCTA000028287504) (accessed 20 January 2023).

the prime minister. Its tasks include setting guidelines for the government's policy regarding the prevention of crime and radicalization of attitudes and supervising their implementation and coordinating the activity of ministries, as well as using budget resources allotted for countering crime and radicalization of attitudes.<sup>42</sup>

Another interesting solution is the Department Council for preventing delinquency and radicalization and combatting drugs, religious deviations and violence towards women. The Department Council's competences include: giving opinions on projects; preparing plans of preventing delinquency and radicalization of attitudes in the department; obtaining information on the activity of local councils for security and preventing delinquency and radicalization of attitudes; presenting proposals to public and private institutions and department bodies interested in preventing delinquency and radicalization of attitudes; coordination of preventive and repressive action in the department, aimed at counteracting and combatting the activity of religious movements which breach laws and fundamental freedoms; preparing programmes of the prevention of crime and radicalization of adolescents and combatting violence towards women and violence in sports; and launching and encouraging initiatives in the field of prevention and implementation of public utility works in the Department.<sup>43</sup>

## THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION – ANTI-TERRORISM IN THE SERVICE OF CURRENT POLICY

The Russian Federation has also been affected by the phenomenon of terrorism and, like other countries, has formed a legal and institutional system for the protection of its political system. While in democratic states these solutions serve the protection of democratic principles, the Russian Federation uses its anti-terrorist and anti-extremist system to protect authoritarianism and – in the conditions of the war against Ukraine – to combat alleged or actual threats to Russia.

Despite the adoption of separate acts regulating the struggle with both extremism and terrorism, Russia considers these two threats as one. In the *Concept of National Security of the Russian Federation*, approved by Presidential Decree No. 24 of 10 January 2000, extremism was recognized as one of the main threats

---

<sup>42</sup> Le Secrétariat général du Comité interministériel de prévention de la délinquance et de la radicalisation (SG-CIPDR), <https://www.cipdr.gouv.fr/le-cipdr/> (accessed 20 January 2023).

<sup>43</sup> *Code de la sécurité intérieure, Version en vigueur au 23 novembre 2021. Section 1: Comité interministériel de prévention de la délinquance et de la radicalisation*, art. D132-1 à D132-4, [https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/codes/section\\_lc/LEGITEXT000025503132/LEGISCTA000028284837/#LEGISCTA000028287504](https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/codes/section_lc/LEGITEXT000025503132/LEGISCTA000028284837/#LEGISCTA000028287504) (accessed 20 January 2023).

to the national security of Russia.<sup>44</sup> It was stated there that the Russian Federation's national interest "in the internal sphere was to maintain the stability of the constitutional order, (...) to ensure social peace, national harmony, territorial integrity, uniform law, the rule of law and democratic society, and to neutralize the causes and factors contributing to the emergence of political phenomena, religious extremism, ethnic separatism and their implications, such as: social, ethnic and religious conflicts, and terrorism".<sup>45</sup>

In 2002, the State Duma of the Russian Federation adopted the *Act on Counteracting Extremist Activities*. Extremism is broadly defined there as: using violence to change the foundations of the constitutional system and breaching the integrity of the Russian Federation; taking (appropriating) power; creating illegal armed groups; carrying out terrorist activity; violence or calling for violence based on racial, national or religious hate; infringing on national dignity; riots, hooliganism and acts of vandalism based on ideological, political, racial, national and religious hate and enmity, or hate or enmity towards any social group; promoting the superiority or inferiority of citizens based on their attitude to religion and social, racial, national, religious or linguistic belonging.<sup>46</sup>

An extremist organization was defined as a social or religious association or another organization which was disbanded or banned by a competent authority (court) in connection with extremist activity. In the Russian Federation, 'extremist materials' were defined as "documents or information in other media designed for publication, calling for extremist activity or justifying the need for such activity, including the work of the leaders of the National Socialist German Workers' Party, the National Fascist Party in Italy, publications justifying racial superiority or the practice of committing military crimes or other offences, the aim of which is to destroy any ethnic, social, racial, national or religious group".<sup>47</sup>

When a given organization has been recognized to commit acts of an extremist character, a competent authority (the Prosecutor General of the FR or another prosecutor subordinate to him, or a federal executive body) submits to it a written warning about the unacceptability of such an activity. The warning may include (if this is possible) a deadline, which is at least two months from the date of issuing it. The organizations which have been deemed extremist are delegalized since in "the Russian Federation it is forbidden to form and run public and religious associations and other organizations the aims of which involve extremist activi-

---

<sup>44</sup> *Ukaz Prezidenta Rossiyskoy Federatsii ot 10.01.2000 g. № 24 O Kontseptsii natsional'noy bezopasnosti Rossiyskoy Federatsii*, <http://pravo.gov.ru/proxy/ips/?docbody=&prevDoc=102063972&backlink=1&&nd=102129631> (accessed 20 January 2023).

<sup>45</sup> *Ibidem*.

<sup>46</sup> *Federal'nyy zakon ot 25 iyulya 2002 g. N 114-FZ "O protivodeystvii ekstremistskoy deyatel'nosti"*, "Rossiiskaya Gazeta", 30 July 2002, No. 138–139 (3006–3007).

<sup>47</sup> *Ibidem*.

ties”.<sup>48</sup> Under the *Act on countering extremist activity*, in the Russian Federation, it is forbidden to disseminate extremist materials and promote extremist activity via mass media. The provisions of the above act correspond with the regulations which penalize extremist acts. Organizing a group of people “with an intention to prepare or commit a crime of an extremist character, and managing such an extremist community, its part or structural units within such a community, as well as forming an association of organizers, leaders or other representatives of parts or structural units of such a community with an aim to prepare plans and (or) conditions of committing crimes of an extremist character (...)”<sup>49</sup> are all subject to criminal liability.

According to the Russian government, the organizations involved in extremist and terrorist activity also include those which work for the self-determination of Ukraine and their activity is limited to this country. Thus, the Russian authorities added to the list of extremist organizations the “Right Sector” (“Правый сектор” на территории Республики Крым», December 2014) and the “Azov” Battalion (Украинское военизированное националистическое объединение «Азов»; батальон «Азов», полк «Азов», September 2022).<sup>50</sup> What reflected the use of the struggle against extremism for general activities related to war was the proposal of amendments to the Penal Code of the Russian Federation submitted to the State Duma which recognized “The violation of the territorial integrity of the Russian Federation as extremism (Article 280 of the Penal Code – “A public call for extremist activity”).<sup>51</sup>

In order to coordinate activities aimed at countering terrorism, the *National Anti-Terrorist Committee* (Национальный антитеррористический комитет, НАК, NAK) was established at the federal level.<sup>52</sup> The NAK’s tasks include, among others: preparing motions to the President of the RF concerning the formulation of state policy regarding the fight against terrorism and the improvement of the Russian legislation in this respect; coordinating the activity of federal executive authorities and anti-terrorist commissions in the constituent

<sup>48</sup> *Ibidem*.

<sup>49</sup> *Ugolovnyy kodeks Rossiyskoy Federatsii (s izmeneniyami na 27 dekabrya 2019 goda)*, Art. 282, 1, <http://docs.cntd.ru/document/9017477> (accessed 20 January 2023). The previous articles of the Penal Code concerned, among others, Art. 280. A public call for extremist activity; Art. 282. Inciting hate or enmity, including the violation of human dignity.

<sup>50</sup> *Terroristicheskiye i ekstremistskiye organizatsii i materialy*, <http://nac.gov.ru/terroristicheskiye-i-ekstremistskiye-organizatsii-i-materialy.html> (accessed 20 January 2023).

<sup>51</sup> *Narusheniye Territorial'noy Tselostnosti Rossii Ili Otchuzhdeniye Chasti Yeyë Territorii Priravnyayut KEkstriemizmu*, <https://antiextremizm.ru/narushenie-territorialnoj-tselostnosti-rossii-ili-otchuzhdenie-chasti-eyo-territorii-priravnyayut-k-ekstremizmu/> (accessed 20 January 2023).

<sup>52</sup> *Ukaz Prezidenta Rossiyskoy Federatsii ot 15 fevralya 2006 g. N 116 O merakh po protivodeystviyu terrorizmu*, <https://rg.ru/2006/02/17/antiterror-doc-dok.html> (accessed 20 January 2023); K. Kraj, *Narodowy Komitet Antyterrorystyczny instrumentem politycznego i militarnego zwalczania terroryzmu w Rosji*, “Bezpieczeństwo. Teoria i Praktyka” 2009, No. 3-4, pp. 49-60.

entities of the Russian Federation regarding the fight against terrorism and organizing their cooperation with the executive authorities of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation, local self-governments, and public associations and organizations; preparing the measures of counteracting terrorism and eliminating its causes and contributing factors, including the measures which ensure the protection of the potential targets of terrorist attacks.<sup>53</sup> After the invasion of Ukraine in 2022, the NAK practically became a part of operations against this country and its citizens on the territory of the Russian Federation, which manifested itself in information about the detention of ‘Ukrainian infiltrators’.<sup>54</sup>

Together with the NAK, another institution was established to coordinate the activities aimed at countering extremism, which was associated with terrorism. The Main Directorate for Combatting Extremism of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Russian Federation (Главное управление по противодействию экстремизму Министерства внутренних дел Российской Федерации, ГУПЭ МВД России, Centre E) was appointed by the Decree of the President of the Russian Federation concerning the establishment of the Counter-Extremist Service of the System of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of Russia No. 1316 of 6 September 2008.<sup>55</sup> Its tasks include: organizing and participating in the formulation of state policy guidelines regarding its activity; combatting extremist activity and terrorism; organizing the cooperation between the Ministry’s divisions and regional executive authorities in matters at their discretion; coordinating the activity of the territorial organs of the Ministry of Internal Affairs and the subdivisions of the central division of the Ministry of Internal Affairs with regard to the activity of the Department of State of the Ministry of Internal Affairs; the organizational and methodological support and providing practical help to the territorial organs of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of Russia and their structural divisions within the scope of their activity.<sup>56</sup> Moreover, Centre E has powers to carry out operational and reconnaissance activities with regard to countering extremism and terrorism as well as religiously or ethnically motivated offences.

In the states in which extremism was recognized as a real threat to the political system and where it constitutes the foundation of terrorism, appropriate steps

---

<sup>53</sup> *Ukaz Prezidenta Rossiyskoy Federatsii ot 15 fevralya 2006 g. N 116...*

<sup>54</sup> Organami bezopasnosti zaderzhan ukrainskiy diversant, <http://nac.gov.ru/kontrterroristicheskie-operacii/fsb/organami-bezopasnosti-zaderzhan-ukrainskiy.html> (accessed 20 January 2023).

<sup>55</sup> *Ukaz Prezidenta Rossiyskoy Federatsii o sozdanii Sluzhby poprotivodeystviyu ekstremizmu sistemy MVD Rossii ot 6 sentyabrya 2008 goda № 1316.* The new decree on countering extremism was issued on 1 March 2011 N248 together with the regulation of the Minister of Internal Affairs of the Russian Federation of 4 March 2011, [https://xn--blaew.xn--plai/mvd/structure1/Glavnie\\_upravlenija/Glavnoe\\_upravlenie\\_po\\_protivodejstviju\\_j](https://xn--blaew.xn--plai/mvd/structure1/Glavnie_upravlenija/Glavnoe_upravlenie_po_protivodejstviju_j) (accessed 20 January 2023).

<sup>56</sup> *Ibidem.*

were taken to counteract these risks. In each of the countries presented above, the measures taken serve the purpose of protecting the state. The main difference between France, Germany and the Russian Federation is the real purpose of protection against extremism. In the Russian Federation, it is used for fighting against the government's political opponents and has become a part of the system of operations related to Russian aggression against Ukraine.

## REFERENCES

- Abteilung "Polizeilicher Staatsschutz" (ST), [https://www.bka.de/DE/DasBKA/OrganisationAufbau/Fachabteilungen/PolizeilicherStaatsschutz/polizeilicherstaatsschutz\\_node.html](https://www.bka.de/DE/DasBKA/OrganisationAufbau/Fachabteilungen/PolizeilicherStaatsschutz/polizeilicherstaatsschutz_node.html) (accessed 20 January 2023)
- Article 29 de la loi no 51-18 du 5 janvier 1951 portant amnistie, instituant un régime de libération anticipée, limitant les effets de la dégradation nationale et réprimant les activités antinationales*, "Journal officiel de la République Française", 6 Janvier 1951, <https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexteArticle.do?idArticle=LEGIA-RTI000006272593&cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006068088&categorieLien=id> (accessed 20 January 2023)
- Article 7 de la loi no 86-1020 du 9 septembre 1986 relative à la lutte contre le terrorisme et aux atteintes à la sûreté de l'État*, "Journal officiel de la République Française", 10 September 1986, No. 210
- Article 9 de la loi no 72-546 du 1er juillet 1972 relative à la lutte contre le racisme*, "Journal officiel de la République Française" No. 0154, 2 July 1972
- Article L212-1, Code de la sécurité intérieure. Version consolidée au 24 octobre 2019*, [https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichCode.do;jsessionid=13792A42D9E4673B2FBFDD0E7E902C10.tplgfr28s\\_2?idSectionTA=LEGISCTA000025508340 &cidTexte=LEGITEXT000025503132&dateTexte=20191027](https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichCode.do;jsessionid=13792A42D9E4673B2FBFDD0E7E902C10.tplgfr28s_2?idSectionTA=LEGISCTA000025508340 &cidTexte=LEGITEXT000025503132&dateTexte=20191027) (accessed 20 January 2023)
- BKA verstärkt den Kampf gegen den islamistischen Terrorismus Neue Abteilung „TE“ im Bundeskriminalamt hat heute die Arbeit aufgenommen*, [https://www.bka.de/DE/Presse/Listenseite\\_Pressemitteilungen/2019/Presse2019/191101\\_AbteilungTE.html;jsessionid=9B6239155404A43DA7680068F5CAFDB9.live0611?nn=50040](https://www.bka.de/DE/Presse/Listenseite_Pressemitteilungen/2019/Presse2019/191101_AbteilungTE.html;jsessionid=9B6239155404A43DA7680068F5CAFDB9.live0611?nn=50040) (accessed 20 January 2023)
- Bundesamt für Verfassungsschutz, "Reichsbürger" and "Selbstverwalter" – *Enemies of the State, Profiteers, Conspiracy Theorists*, Cologne 2018
- Bundesministerium der Justiz und für Verbraucherschutz Strafgesetzbuch (StGB), par. 129b, [https://www.gesetze-im-internet.de/stgb/inhalts\\_bersicht.html](https://www.gesetze-im-internet.de/stgb/inhalts_bersicht.html) (accessed 20 January 2023).
- Code de la sécurité intérieure*, [https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/codes/section\\_lc/LEGITEXT000025503132/LEGISCTA000025505187/#LEGISCTA000025508342](https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/codes/section_lc/LEGITEXT000025503132/LEGISCTA000025505187/#LEGISCTA000025508342) (accessed 20 January 2023)
- Code de la sécurité intérieure, Version en vigueur au 23 novembre 2021. Section 1: Comité interministériel de prévention de la délinquance et de la radicalisa-*

- tion, [https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/codes/section\\_lc/LEGITEXT000025503132/LEGISCTA000028284837/#LEGISCTA000028287504](https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/codes/section_lc/LEGITEXT000025503132/LEGISCTA000028284837/#LEGISCTA000028287504) (accessed 20 January 2023)
- Code de la sécurité intérieure, Version en vigueur au 23 novembre 2021. Section 1: Comité interministériel de prévention de la délinquance et de la radicalisation*, [https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/codes/section\\_lc/LEGITEXT000025503132/LEGISCTA000028284837/#LEGISCTA000028287504](https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/codes/section_lc/LEGITEXT000025503132/LEGISCTA000028284837/#LEGISCTA000028287504) (accessed 20 January 2023)
- Code monétaire et financier*, Dernière modification: 25 octobre 2019, [https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichCode.do;jsessionid=0F204B989BEB83B344A350D5E-4A72B83.tplgfr28s\\_2?cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006072026&dateTexte=20130728](https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichCode.do;jsessionid=0F204B989BEB83B344A350D5E-4A72B83.tplgfr28s_2?cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006072026&dateTexte=20130728) (accessed 20 January 2023)
- Konstytucja Republiki Francuskiej z dnia 4 października 1958 r.*, translated by W. Skrzydło, as of 23 July 2008, <http://libr.sejm.gov.pl/tek01/txt/konst/francja2011.html> (accessed 20 January 2023)
- Décret n° 82-1100 du 22 décembre 1982 fixant les attributions de la direction de la surveillance du territoire*, <http://admi.net/jo/dec82-1100.html> (accessed 20 January 2023)
- Der Verfassungsschutz, <https://www.verfassungsschutz.de/de/arbeitsfelder/af-islamismus-und-islamistischer-terrorismus/verbotene-organisationen-islamismus> (accessed 20 January 2023)
- Entwurf eines Gesetzes zum besseren Informationsaustausch bei der Bekämpfung des internationalen Terrorismus. Gesetzentwurf der Fraktionen der CDU/CSU und SPD*, Deutscher Bundestag 18. Wahlperiode, Drucksache 18/8702, 7 June 2016
- Entwurf eines Gesetzes zur Bekämpfung des internationalen Terrorismus (Terrorismusbekämpfungsgesetz), Gesetzentwurf der Fraktionen SPD und BÜNDNIS 90/DIE GRÜNEN*, Deutscher Bundestag 14. Wahlperiode, Drucksache 14/7386 (neu), 8 November 2001
- Eröffnung des Gemeinsamen Extremismus- und Terrorismusabwehrzentrums (GETZ)*, [https://www.bmi.bund.de/SharedDocs/pressemitteilungen/DE/2012/11/eroeffnung\\_getz.html](https://www.bmi.bund.de/SharedDocs/pressemitteilungen/DE/2012/11/eroeffnung_getz.html) (accessed 20 January 2023)
- Gemeinsames Extremismus- und Terrorismusabwehrzentrum (GETZ)*, [https://www.verfassungsschutz.de/DE/verfassungsschutz/auftrag/zusammenarbeit-im-in-und-ausland/getz/getz\\_node.html](https://www.verfassungsschutz.de/DE/verfassungsschutz/auftrag/zusammenarbeit-im-in-und-ausland/getz/getz_node.html) (accessed 20 January 2023)
- Gesetz zur Abwehr von Gefahren des internationalen Terrorismus durch das Bundeskriminalamt* BGBl. I, 2008
- Gibadło L., Kędzierski M., *Niemcy: aresztowania pod zarzutem przygotowań do puczu*, <https://www.osw.waw.pl/pl/publikacje/analizy/2022-12-07/niemcy-aresztowania-pod-zarzutem-przygotowan-do-puczu> (accessed 20 February 2023)
- Heinig H.M., *Die Verfassung der Religion: Beiträge zum Religionsverfassungsrecht*, Tübingen 2014
- Hołub A., *Niemieckie „pakiety antyterrorystyczne” – odpowiedź na zagrożenie terroryzmem XXI wieku*, (in:) W. Zubrzycki, K. Jałoszyński, K. Jałoszyński (eds.), *Polska ustawa antyterrorystyczna – odpowiedź na zagrożenia współczesnym terroryzmem*, Szczytno 2016
- Kraj K., *Narodowy Komitet Antyterrorystyczny instrumentem politycznego i militarnego zwalczania terroryzmu w Rosji*, “Bezpieczeństwo. Teoria i Praktyka” 2009, No. 3–4

- Le Secrétariat général du Comité interministériel de prévention de la délinquance et de la radicalisation (SG-CIPDR), <https://www.cipdr.gouv.fr/le-cipdr/> (accessed 20 January 2023)
- Livre IV : Des crimes et délits contre la nation, l'Etat et la paix publique, Code Penal, Code pénal, Version consolidée au 20 septembre 2019*, <https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichCode.do?cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006070719&dateTexte=20191020> (accessed 20 January 2023)
- Loi du 10 janvier 1936 sur les groupes de combat et milices privées*, "Journal officiel de la République Française", 12 January 1936
- Loi n° 86-1020 du 9 septembre 1986 relative à la lutte contre le terrorisme*, "Journal officiel de la République Française", 1986-09-10, No. 210
- Marszałek-Kawa J., Plecka D., Hołub A., *Social Security. Selected Aspects*, Toruń 2018.
- Olech A., *Unikalne rozwiązania Republiki Francuskiej w walce z terroryzmem i radykalizacją*, "Terroryzm – Studia, Analizy, Prewencja" 2022, No. 1 (1)
- Oleksiewicz I., *Polityka antyterrorystyczna Unii Europejskiej*, Lublin 2013.
- Ordonnance du 30 décembre 1944 portant modification de la loi du 10 janvier 1936 sur les groupes de combat et milices privées*, "Journal officiel de la République Française", no. 163 du 31 décembre 1944
- Papier H.-J., Durner W., *Streitbare Demokratie*, "Archiv Des Öffentlichen Rechts" 2003, Bd. 128, H. 3, <http://www.jstor.org/stable/44316813> (accessed 20 February 2023)
- Presseinformation des Bundesamtes für Verfassungsschutz (BfV) zum Start des Gemeinsamen Extremismus- und Terrorismusabwehrzentrums zur Bekämpfung des Rechtsextremismus/-terrorismus, des Linksextremismus/-terrorismus, des Ausländerextremismus/-terrorismus und der Spionage/Proliferation (GETZ), abgerufen am 17 November 2012
- Sicherheitspaket I*, "Die Welt", 19 October 2001, <http://www.welt.de/print-welt/article482247/Sicherheitspaket-1.html> (accessed 20 January 2023)
- Sicherheitspaket II, Mehr Kompetenzen*, <http://www.n-tv.de/politik/Mehr-Kompetenzen-article102602.html> (accessed 20 January 2023)
- Zoom sur le nouveau Parquet national antiterroriste, <http://www.justice.gouv.fr/justice-penale-11330/zoom-sur-le-nouveau-parquet-national-antiterroriste-32661.html> (accessed 20 March 2023)
- Narusheniye Territorial'noy Tselostnosti Rossii Ili Otchuzhdeniye Chasti Yeyë Territorii Priravnyayut K Ekstriemizmu, <https://antiextremizm.ru/narushenie-territorialnoj-tselostnosti-rossii-ili-otchuzhdenie-chasti-eyo-territorii-priravnyayut-k-ekstremizmu/> (accessed 20 January 2023)
- Organami bezopasnosti zaderzhan ukrainskiy diversant, <http://nac.gov.ru/kontrterroristicheskie-operacii/fsb/organami-bezopasnosti-zaderzhan-ukrainskiy.html> (accessed 20 January 2023)
- Terroristicheskiye i ekstremistskiye organizatsii i materialy, <http://nac.gov.ru/terroristicheskie-i-ekstremistskie-organizacii-i-materialy.html> (accessed 20 January 2023)
- Ugolovnyy kodeks Rossiyskoy Federatsii (s izmeneniyami na 27 dekabrya 2019 goda)*, <http://docs.cntd.ru/document/9017477> (accessed 20 January 2023)
- Ukaz Prezidenta Rossiyskoy Federatsii o sozdanii Sluzhby po protivodeystviyu ekstremizmu sistemy MVD Rossii ot 6 sentyabrya 2008 goda № 1316*

*Ukaz Prezidenta Rossiyskoy Federatsii ot 15 fevralya 2006 g. N 116 O merakh po protivodeystviyu terrorizmu*, <https://rg.ru/2006/02/17/antiterror-doc-dok.html> (accessed 20 January 2023)

*Ukaz Prezidenta Rossiyskoy Federatsii ot 10.01.2000 g. № 24 O Kontseptsii natsional'noy bezopasnosti Rossiyskoy Federatsii*, <http://pravo.gov.ru/proxy/ips/?docbody=&prevDoc=102063972&backlink=1&&nd=102129631> (accessed 20 January 2023)

*Federal'nyy zakon ot 25 iyulya 2002 g. N 114-FZ "O protivodeystvii ekstremistskoy deyatel'nosti"*, "Rossiiskaya Gazeta", 30 July 2002, No. 138–139 (3006–3007)